

The parties' motion for a so-ordered subpoena (ECF No. 15) is DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. The proposed subpoena (ECF No. 15-1) is directed to "New York State Trooper," not an identified agency (such as the New York State Police). By **Friday, April 1, 2022**, the parties may refile a motion for a so-ordered subpoena, which: (i) identifies with specificity the entity to produce documents, and includes contact information for the entity; (ii) provides identifying information regarding the Plaintiff, in addition to his name, including a date of birth and NYSID, if available to the parties; and (iii) directs that documents shall be returnable to the Court, not to the parties. Failure to comply with these directives may result in a denial of the application. The parties shall comply with the Court's Practices and ECF instructions regarding sealed applications and PII.

The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to close ECF No. 15.

SO ORDERED 3/28/2022


SARAH L. CAVE
United States Magistrate Judge

Re: Paul Phillips v. The City of New York, et al.,
21 CV 8149 (ALC)(SLC)

Your Honor:

This firm, along with co-counsel, represents Plaintiff. We submit this request jointly with Defendants to respectfully request that the Court endorse the attached proposed subpoena directing the New York State Trooper to produce Plaintiff's file and documents related to his July 3, 2020 arrest in Guilderland, New York giving rise to the civil rights allegations described in the Complaint.

On October 18, 2021, Plaintiff provided a 160.50 unsealing authorization to the City to obtain records from the NYS Trooper. Plaintiff submitted the authorization that appears on the SDNY website for Plan mediation. On March 15, 2022, ACC Mostafa Khairy, counsel for the Defendants, informed us that the Trooper rejected the authorization because, according to the Trooper, the authorization listed the wrong individual as the corporation counsel.

While Plaintiff's and Defendants' counsel believe this complaint from the Trooper to be without merit, in order to avoid further delay Plaintiff executed a new 160.50 release and provided it to the City on March 22, 2022. The Trooper has not provided the documents pursuant to this release nor have they provided a date certain by when they expect to provide these documents.

The parties require these documents to go forward with the mediation. Due to the lack of documents, the parties have had to adjourn the mediation to April 19th. To avoid any further delay, the parties respectfully request that the Court endorse the attached proposed subpoena.

The parties thank the Court for its time and consideration.

Respectfully submitted,


Jessica Massimi

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Southern District of New York

Paul Phillips

Plaintiff

v.

City of New York, et al.,

Defendant

Civil Action No. 21 CV 8149 (ALC)(SLC)

SUBPOENA TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS, INFORMATION, OR OBJECTS
OR TO PERMIT INSPECTION OF PREMISES IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: New York State Trooper

(Name of person to whom this subpoena is directed)

☒ **Production:** **YOU ARE COMMANDED** to produce at the time, date, and place set forth below the following documents, electronically stored information, or objects, and to permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the material: Paul Phillips' file and documents related to his July 3, 2020 arrest in Guilderland, New York

Place: Cohen and Green
Attention Jessica Massimi
By Email at Jessica@FemmeLaw.Com

Date and Time:

04/05/2022 1:00 pm

☐ **Inspection of Premises:** **YOU ARE COMMANDED** to permit entry onto the designated premises, land, or other property possessed or controlled by you at the time, date, and location set forth below, so that the requesting party may inspect, measure, survey, photograph, test, or sample the property or any designated object or operation on it.

Place:

Date and Time:

The following provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 45 are attached – Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; Rule 45(d), relating to your protection as a person subject to a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to respond to this subpoena and the potential consequences of not doing so.

Date: 03/25/2022

CLERK OF COURT

OR

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Attorney's signature

The name, address, e-mail address, and telephone number of the attorney representing (name of party) Paul Phillips, who issues or requests this subpoena, are:

Jessica Massimi, Cohen and Green PLLC, 1639 Centre Street, Suite 216, Ridgewood, NY 11385,
Jessica@FemmeLaw.Com, 929-888-9480

Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

A notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

Civil Action No. 21 CV 8149 (ALC)(SLC)

PROOF OF SERVICE*(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)*

I received this subpoena for *(name of individual and title, if any)* _____
 on *(date)* _____.

☐ I served the subpoena by delivering a copy to the named person as follows: _____

_____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I returned the subpoena unexecuted because: _____

Unless the subpoena was issued on behalf of the United States, or one of its officers or agents, I have also
 tendered to the witness the fees for one day's attendance, and the mileage allowed by law, in the amount of
 \$ _____.

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ 0.00 .

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: _____

Server's signature

Printed name and title

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45 (c), (d), (e), and (g) (Effective 12/1/13)**(c) Place of Compliance.**

(1) For a Trial, Hearing, or Deposition. A subpoena may command a person to attend a trial, hearing, or deposition only as follows:

- (A) within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; or
- (B) within the state where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person, if the person
 - (i) is a party or a party's officer; or
 - (ii) is commanded to attend a trial and would not incur substantial expense.

(2) For Other Discovery. A subpoena may command:

- (A) production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things at a place within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; and
- (B) inspection of premises at the premises to be inspected.

(d) Protecting a Person Subject to a Subpoena; Enforcement.

(1) Avoiding Undue Burden or Expense; Sanctions. A party or attorney responsible for issuing and serving a subpoena must take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to the subpoena. The court for the district where compliance is required must enforce this duty and impose an appropriate sanction—which may include lost earnings and reasonable attorney's fees—on a party or attorney who fails to comply.

(2) Command to Produce Materials or Permit Inspection.

(A) *Appearance Not Required.* A person commanded to produce documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, or to permit the inspection of premises, need not appear in person at the place of production or inspection unless also commanded to appear for a deposition, hearing, or trial.

(B) *Objections.* A person commanded to produce documents or tangible things or to permit inspection may serve on the party or attorney designated in the subpoena a written objection to inspecting, copying, testing, or sampling any or all of the materials or to inspecting the premises—or to producing electronically stored information in the form or forms requested. The objection must be served before the earlier of the time specified for compliance or 14 days after the subpoena is served. If an objection is made, the following rules apply:

- (i) At any time, on notice to the commanded person, the serving party may move the court for the district where compliance is required for an order compelling production or inspection.
- (ii) These acts may be required only as directed in the order, and the order must protect a person who is neither a party nor a party's officer from significant expense resulting from compliance.

(3) Quashing or Modifying a Subpoena.

(A) *When Required.* On timely motion, the court for the district where compliance is required must quash or modify a subpoena that:

- (i) fails to allow a reasonable time to comply;
- (ii) requires a person to comply beyond the geographical limits specified in Rule 45(c);
- (iii) requires disclosure of privileged or other protected matter, if no exception or waiver applies; or
- (iv) subjects a person to undue burden.

(B) *When Permitted.* To protect a person subject to or affected by a subpoena, the court for the district where compliance is required may, on motion, quash or modify the subpoena if it requires:

- (i) disclosing a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information; or

(ii) disclosing an unretained expert's opinion or information that does not describe specific occurrences in dispute and results from the expert's study that was not requested by a party.

(C) *Specifying Conditions as an Alternative.* In the circumstances described in Rule 45(d)(3)(B), the court may, instead of quashing or modifying a subpoena, order appearance or production under specified conditions if the serving party:

- (i) shows a substantial need for the testimony or material that cannot be otherwise met without undue hardship; and
- (ii) ensures that the subpoenaed person will be reasonably compensated.

(e) Duties in Responding to a Subpoena.

(1) Producing Documents or Electronically Stored Information. These procedures apply to producing documents or electronically stored information:

(A) *Documents.* A person responding to a subpoena to produce documents must produce them as they are kept in the ordinary course of business or must organize and label them to correspond to the categories in the demand.

(B) *Form for Producing Electronically Stored Information Not Specified.* If a subpoena does not specify a form for producing electronically stored information, the person responding must produce it in a form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a reasonably usable form or forms.

(C) *Electronically Stored Information Produced in Only One Form.* The person responding need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.

(D) *Inaccessible Electronically Stored Information.* The person responding need not provide discovery of electronically stored information from sources that the person identifies as not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. On motion to compel discovery or for a protective order, the person responding must show that the information is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. If that showing is made, the court may nonetheless order discovery from such sources if the requesting party shows good cause, considering the limitations of Rule 26(b)(2)(C). The court may specify conditions for the discovery.

(2) Claiming Privilege or Protection.

(A) *Information Withheld.* A person withholding subpoenaed information under a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as trial-preparation material must:

- (i) expressly make the claim; and
- (ii) describe the nature of the withheld documents, communications, or tangible things in a manner that, without revealing information itself privileged or protected, will enable the parties to assess the claim.

(B) *Information Produced.* If information produced in response to a subpoena is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation material, the person making the claim may notify any party that received the information of the claim and the basis for it. After being notified, a party must promptly return, sequester, or destroy the specified information and any copies it has; must not use or disclose the information until the claim is resolved; must take reasonable steps to retrieve the information if the party disclosed it before being notified; and may promptly present the information under seal to the court for the district where compliance is required for a determination of the claim. The person who produced the information must preserve the information until the claim is resolved.

(g) Contempt.

The court for the district where compliance is required—and also, after a motion is transferred, the issuing court—may hold in contempt a person who, having been served, fails without adequate excuse to obey the subpoena or an order related to it.